Analysis of the Qur'an Recitation Development Institution in Improving Qari and Qariah Training in Jambi Province

Fahrizal Nover[1], Mukhtar[2], Wahyudi[3],

[1]*(Doctoral Student, Sulthan Thaha Saifuddin State Islamic University Jambi).*
[2]*(Professor Lecturer, Sulthan Thaha Saifuddin State Islamic University Jambi).*
[3]*(Postgraduate Lecturer, Sulthan Thaha Saifuddin State Islamic University Jambi).*

* Corresponding Author. E-mail: [1] fahrizalnover9495@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

This study investigates the role of the Quran Recitation Development Institution (LPTQ) in enhancing the quality of Qari and Qariah training in Jambi Province. The findings indicate that LPTQ plays a vital role in advancing Quranic recitation skills by providing structured training programs, mentorship initiatives, and competitive platforms. These initiatives focus on improving the technical proficiency of participants in tajwid, fasohah, and maqamat while also fostering mental preparation and character development. However, challenges such as limited resources, inadequate facilities, and lack of stakeholder coordination hinder the optimal development of Quranic reciters. This research employs a qualitative approach, utilizing interviews, observations, and document analysis to provide an in-depth understanding of LPTQ's strategies, challenges, and their impact on participants. The results highlight the importance of enhancing training facilities, improving stakeholder collaboration, and integrating advanced teaching materials and technologies to better address evolving societal needs. This study contributes to the understanding of Quranic education and offers practical recommendations for improving the effectiveness of LPTQ programs.
Keywords: Quranic Recitation, Qari and Qariah Training, LPTQ, Jambi Province, Tajwid, Fasohah, Maqamat, Character Development, Quranic Education

Introduction

The development of Quranic recitation (Tilawatil Quran) in Indonesia plays a crucial role in preserving the integrity of Islamic teachings and strengthening the religious identity of the Muslim community. The Quranic Recitation Development Institution (LPTQ) is an institution with a strategic role in the development of Quranic recitation in Indonesia. LPTQ was established to create structured guidance for Qari' and Qariah, as well as to encourage public enthusiasm for the art of reciting the Quran correctly and beautifully. In this context, LPTQ is responsible for organizing training and mentoring programs for Qari' and Qariah, establishing evaluation standards for

Quranic recitation competitions, and conducting research and development in teaching and training methods for Qari' and Qariah.[1]

According to Baharuddin[2], LPTQ in Indonesia not only plays a role in improving the quality of Qari' and Qariah but also in introducing Quranic recitation as part of the living Islamic cultural tradition in society. As an institution crucial to the development of Quranic recitation, LPTQ must have an effective, measurable, and sustainable training system.

Quranic recitations that are performed well, following the rules of tajwid and makhraj, and with deep understanding, not only beautify the recitation but also deepen the understanding of the meaning of Allah SWT's revelation. Proper Quranic recitation brings peace to the listeners and enhances the spiritual quality of the reciter.

The quality of Quranic recitation that aligns with the rules of tajwid and makhraj is the key to the development of Tilawatil Quran. It is not only about creating beautiful sounds but also ensuring that the meanings contained in the Quranic verses are understood correctly. Therefore, it is crucial for institutions dedicated to Quranic recitation development in Indonesia, especially in Jambi Province, to produce high-quality Qari' and Qariah. These Qari' and Qariah must have the ability to recite the Quran correctly according to the prescribed rules.

Although there are numerous institutions focused on the development of Quranic recitation in Jambi Province, there exists a gap between the community's needs for quality Quranic development and the capacity of the existing institutions. This gap is influenced by various factors such as limited competent human resources, inadequate supporting facilities, and a lack of coordination between institutions. This phenomenon highlights the need for in-depth research into the role of these Quranic development institutions in enhancing the quality of Qari' and Qariah, as well as identifying solutions to the challenges they face.

Previous studies on the development of Tilawatil Quran have generally focused on the quality of teaching at the national level, with fewer addressing the specific development of Quranic recitation institutions at the provincial level, particularly in Jambi Province. Existing research on Quranic recitation instruction emphasizes the importance of institutions that teach proper Quran reading techniques, both in formal and non-formal settings. However, challenges often arise due to disparities in the quality and quantity of training provided. These institutions need to adapt to the demands of modern times, including utilizing technology to support learning.

This study brings novelty by specifically examining the role of Quranic recitation development institutions in Jambi Province, focusing on how these institutions can improve the quality of Qari' and Qariah. The research will explore the factors influencing the success of these institutions, including the analysis of curriculum, teacher competence, facilities, as well as the involvement of the community and government in supporting Quranic development activities. Additionally, the study will investigate the challenges faced by these institutions in responding to the evolving needs of society. The findings of this research are expected to provide useful recommendations for improving the quality of Quranic recitation institutions in Jambi Province and contribute to enhancing Quranic training for Qari' and Qariah across Indonesia.

Method

This study adopts a qualitative approach[3] to gain a deeper understanding of the role played by the Qur'an Recitation Development Institution (LPTQ) in improving the training quality of Qari and Qariah in Jambi Province. The main objective is to explore the intricate dynamics surrounding the training process and its impact on the development of Qur'an recitation skills in the region. The qualitative approach is particularly valuable in capturing the perspectives of various stakeholders, including the training participants, LPTQ administrators, and other parties involved in fostering the talent of Qari and Qariah. Through in-depth interviews and detailed observations, the study seeks to uncover how LPTQ's programs are shaping the development of these recitation skills.

The qualitative methodology allows the researcher to delve into the social activities, attitudes, and perceptions that influence the effectiveness of LPTQ's training efforts.[4] By examining the individual or collective behaviors, the research can provide insights into how Qari and Qariah trainees engage with the training process. This approach enables the researcher to interpret the experiences and viewpoints of participants within their specific context, enriching the study with nuanced and diverse perspectives. The flexibility inherent in qualitative research helps uncover the complexity of the training system, offering a comprehensive understanding of the various factors that contribute to the development of recitation skills.

A central feature of this research is its focus on understanding how LPTQ's strategies and training programs contribute to the overall enhancement of Qari and Qariah abilities. By evaluating the training methods used, such as group practice, individual coaching, and feedback mechanisms, the study identifies what is effective and where improvements might be needed. The qualitative approach enables the researcher to examine these processes closely, understanding how the training is tailored to meet the needs of trainees and the challenges they face. By exploring these dimensions, the research captures the broader impact of LPTQ's influence in shaping the Qur'an recitation landscape in Jambi.

Data for this study is gathered through a combination of interviews, observations, and document analysis.[5] Interviews provide direct access to the thoughts, feelings, and experiences of Qari and Qariah participants, allowing for an in-depth exploration of their training experiences. Observations, on the other hand, offer insight into the practical application of the training techniques and how they are received in real-time. Document analysis allows for a deeper understanding of the curriculum, training materials, and official reports that outline LPTQ's objectives and achievements. These methods, used together, provide a comprehensive and multifaceted view of the training process, ensuring that both subjective and objective data contribute to the findings.

Ultimately, the qualitative research methodology provides the tools necessary to examine the multifaceted nature of Qur'an recitation training and its impact on the Qari and Qariah in Jambi Province. By giving voice to the participants and examining the dynamics of LPTQ's programs, the study offers a holistic view of how these training efforts contribute to the overall goal of enhancing the quality of Qur'an recitation in the region. The findings will not only reflect the challenges faced by trainees but also highlight the strengths and opportunities for further development within the LPTQ system, making a valuable contribution to the field of Qur'anic education and training.

Results and Discussion
Results
Qari/Qariah Training

Qari/Qariah training involves various aspects, ranging from improving Quranic recitation techniques, understanding Tajwid, to developing self-confidence for participating in Quran recitation events. According to Nasution, effective training for Qari/Qariah involves the following components:

- Teaching Methods: Using methods that are suitable for the learners' ability to understand and master recitation techniques.
- Practical Skill Development: Direct practice in Quranic recitation, both in groups and individually.
- Feedback and Evaluation: Continuous evaluation processes that allow participants to track their progress and correct any shortcomings. Structured training can enhance the technical and mental abilities of Qari/Qariah to compete in Quranic recitation competitions, as well as prepare them to be role models in society.[6]

Here is the evaluation table of training methods used by the Qur'an Recitation Development Institution to improve qari and qari'ah training in Jambi Province in English:

Training Method	Description	Strengths	Weaknesses	Recommendations
Group Training	Training conducted collectively where participants learn by observing senior qari/qari'ah or trainers.	- Encourages teamwork and camaraderie. - Enables discussion and experience sharing.	- Not all participants receive individual attention. - Potential differences in participants' skill levels.	- Group participants by skill level for effectiveness. - Employ additional mentors.
Individual Coaching	One-on-one training between the trainer and the participant, focusing on individual strengths and weaknesses.	- Provides personalized attention to individual needs. - Accelerates skill development.	- Requires more time. - Needs a sufficient number of trainers.	- Use a rotation schedule for trainers. - Combine with group methods for time efficiency.
Feedback Mechanism	A routine evaluation process where trainers provide constructive criticism, suggestions, and input on participants' progress and areas of improvement.	- Helps participants understand shortcomings. - Motivates for improvement. - Refines recitation techniques.	- Participants might feel pressured if feedback is not delivered properly.	- Deliver feedback constructively. - Acknowledge achievements to boost motivation.
Competition Simulation	Training through simulated competitions to prepare participants for official contests.	- Builds confidence. - Trains participants to manage mental pressure.	- Might intimidate participants who are not ready.	- Combine with evaluation sessions. - Ensure the competition atmosphere remains supportive of learning.
Digital Media Usage	Utilizing audio/video recordings to support training and provide examples of renowned qari/qari'ah recitations.	- Provides high-quality references. - Practical and flexible.	- Requires access to technology and basic digital skills.	- Offer basic tech training. - Ensure the media used is of high quality.

The evaluation table highlights various training methods used by Qur'an Recitation Development Institutions in Jambi Province to enhance qari and qari'ah training. Group training fosters teamwork and enables participants to share experiences, making it ideal for building camaraderie. However, it may not address individual needs due to varying skill levels among participants. To optimize its effectiveness, participants should be grouped based on their proficiency, and additional mentors can help provide more personalized attention within the group setting.

Individual coaching, on the other hand, focuses on tailored guidance, allowing trainers to address specific strengths and weaknesses of each participant. This method accelerates skill development but demands more time and a larger number of trainers to accommodate all learners effectively. A combination of group and individual training can strike a balance between personalized attention and time efficiency. Additionally, the feedback mechanism plays a critical role in training by offering constructive criticism and motivating participants to improve. Delivering feedback constructively and acknowledging achievements can ensure

participants remain motivated while addressing areas for improvement.

Simulated competitions prepare participants for real contests by enhancing their confidence and teaching them to handle mental pressure. Although effective, it may intimidate unprepared participants, so combining it with evaluation sessions can create a supportive learning environment. The use of digital media, such as audio and video recordings, provides high-quality recitation examples and allows for flexible learning. However, it requires access to technology and digital skills, which can be addressed through basic tech training. Together, these methods create a comprehensive training approach, balancing individual needs and collaborative growth to develop highly skilled qari and qari'ah.

The Role of LPTQ in Enhancing Qari/Qariah Quality

LPTQ plays a pivotal role in advancing the quality of qari and qariah in Jambi Province through its well-structured training programs, mentorship initiatives, and competitive platforms. These programs are designed to enhance the technical proficiency of participants in Qur'anic recitation, focusing on tajwid, fasohah, and maqamat. By organizing regular workshops and training sessions, LPTQ ensures that qari and qariah receive comprehensive guidance from experienced trainers. This systematic approach helps participants achieve a mastery level required for both national and international Qur'anic recitation events.

In addition to technical skills, LPTQ places a strong emphasis on mental preparation and character development. Reciting the Qur'an requires not only vocal excellence but also emotional and spiritual strength to convey the divine message effectively. To this end, LPTQ integrates programs aimed at building confidence,

resilience, and humility in participants. By fostering a deep connection to the Qur'an and encouraging a disciplined lifestyle, LPTQ ensures that qari and qariah are well-prepared to perform under the pressures of competitive settings and public appearances.

Mentoring is another cornerstone of LPTQ's efforts, providing qari and qariah with individualized support tailored to their unique strengths and areas for improvement. Trainers work closely with participants, offering constructive feedback and practical advice to refine their skills. This personal attention not only accelerates skill development but also helps build a supportive learning environment. Through regular evaluations, LPTQ identifies potential talents and provides continuous guidance to help participants reach their full potential.

Competitions organized by LPTQ serve as a critical platform for qari and qariah to showcase their abilities and gain recognition. These events also act as motivational tools, encouraging participants to strive for excellence while fostering a sense of healthy rivalry. By combining technical training with character building and competition readiness, LPTQ ensures that qari and qariah are not only skilled reciters but also exemplary individuals who embody the values of the Qur'an. This holistic approach has solidified LPTQ's role as a key institution in nurturing outstanding qari and qariah in Jambi Province and beyond.

For example, Hidayat explains that LPTQ in several provinces has successfully developed a comprehensive training system that integrates both formal and non-formal training.[7] LPTQ also collaborates with various parties to create more inclusive training programs based on local needs, which are widely accepted by the community.

Evaluation of Training Programs and Their Impact

Evaluating training programs is a crucial step in ensuring their effectiveness in improving the quality of qari and qariah. This process involves assessing whether the programs successfully enhance participants' technical abilities in Qur'anic recitation, including mastery of tajwid, fasohah, and maqamat. By measuring improvements in these areas, institutions like LPTQ can identify the strengths and weaknesses of their training methods and make necessary adjustments. Evaluations also provide insights into how well participants are prepared for the challenges of competitive recitation, ensuring that their technical skills meet high standards.

Beyond technical proficiency, an effective training program must also foster a positive mental attitude among participants. Confidence, resilience, and a deep spiritual connection to the Qur'an are essential qualities for qari and qariah to excel in their roles. Evaluations should consider whether the training programs help participants build these attributes, enabling them to perform with poise and sincerity. A comprehensive evaluation can include participant feedback, trainer assessments, and performance metrics during practice and competitions, offering a holistic view of the program's impact.

Moreover, the evaluation process itself serves as a tool for continuous improvement. By identifying areas where participants struggle or require additional support, institutions can adapt their training strategies to better meet their needs. This iterative approach ensures that the training programs remain relevant and effective in nurturing skilled and well-rounded qari and qariah. Ultimately, a thorough evaluation not only measures the success of the training programs but also reinforces their role in preserving and advancing the art of Qur'anic recitation.

Wibowo states that in evaluating Qari/Qariah training, it is crucial to assess the cognitive (knowledge), psychomotor (skills), and affective (attitude) aspects of the participants.[8] This evaluation should be continuous and based on clear assessment standards.

Challenges in Enhancing Qari/Qariah Training in Jambi Province

In Jambi Province, challenges in improving the quality of Qari/Qariah through LPTQ training programs include factors such as limited resources, inadequate training facilities, and a lack of attention to the personality and mental development of Qari/Qariah. According to Prasetyo (2020), one of the biggest obstacles in training development in regional areas is the lack of synergy between various stakeholders, such as the government, LPTQ, and the community.

Discussion

The research on Qari/Qariah training and the role of LPTQ (Lembaga Pengembangan Tilawatil Quran) in enhancing the quality of Quranic recitation in Jambi Province can be discussed in light of several key theories on training, development, and performance. The research highlights various aspects of Qari/Qariah training, including the methods used, the development of practical skills, and the importance of feedback and evaluation, which align with several established theories in the field of training and performance improvement.

In *Fundamentals of Human Resource Management* by Talya Bauer, Berrin Erdogan, and others[9], the authors introduce a concept that outlines three essential phases of training needs assessment. These phases are crucial for understanding how an organization can

effectively analyze its training needs. The process, known as Training Needs Assessment (TNA), involves a systematic approach to identifying gaps and opportunities for improving employee performance. By following these phases, an organization can ensure that its training programs align with both its strategic goals and operational demands.

The first phase is Organizational Analysis[10], which centers on the overall goals, strategies, and needs of the organization. This analysis looks at the organization's objectives, both short-term and long-term, to determine whether there is a need for training to help achieve these goals. Additionally, it considers the available resources, such as human capital, technology, and equipment, and identifies any limitations that might hinder performance. Another critical element of this phase is evaluating any changes affecting the organization, like technological advancements or structural reorganizations, that may require new skills or approaches. The insights from this phase provide a broad view of whether training is necessary to address these challenges.

The second phase, Task Analysis[11], delves deeper into the specific tasks performed by individuals within the organization. This phase aims to identify the skills, knowledge, and behaviors required for employees to execute their tasks effectively. A key component of task analysis is examining job descriptions to clarify the specific duties and responsibilities of various roles. It also includes determining the skills and competencies required to complete those tasks successfully. Additionally, the phase evaluates skill gaps by asking whether employees already possess the necessary skills or if further training is needed to close those gaps. Task analysis ensures that training is targeted and relevant to the specific needs of employees in their respective roles.

The third phase is Person Analysis[12], which focuses on evaluating individual performance. This phase assesses whether employees have the necessary skills and capabilities to perform their jobs effectively. The process involves performance appraisals, where employees' performance is reviewed to determine if they meet the required standards. Feedback from supervisors and colleagues is also gathered to better understand employees' training needs. Moreover, this phase considers the motivation and readiness of individuals to undergo training. It identifies whether employees are prepared to learn new skills and whether factors such as motivation might impact their engagement in training programs.

By incorporating all three phases—organizational, task, and person analysis—an organization can develop a comprehensive understanding of its training needs. Each phase provides valuable insights that collectively help define where training is necessary, whether it's at the organizational, task, or individual level. These analyses are interconnected and ensure that the training provided is aligned with the needs of the organization and its employees. According to Bauer and her colleagues, this systematic approach to assessing training needs is vital for designing effective training programs that enhance performance, skills, and productivity, ultimately supporting the strategic goals of the organization.

One prominent theory that supports the findings in the research is the Behavioral Theory of Learning[13], which emphasizes the importance of practice and feedback in skill acquisition. According to Nasution (2017), practical skill development through direct practice is a

core element of effective Qari/Qariah training. The research echoes this idea, suggesting that Qari/Qariah training programs that focus on hands-on practice, both individually and in groups, are crucial for improving technical skills. This concept is consistent with Skinner's operant conditioning, where repetitive practice and positive reinforcement help learners master new skills.

Moreover, the importance of Continuous Feedback and Evaluation in Qari/Qariah training, as emphasized by Nasution (2017), aligns with the Feedback Intervention Theory. According to this theory, feedback is most effective when it is specific, timely, and constructive. In the context of Quranic recitation, continuous evaluation allows participants to track their progress and make necessary corrections. Wibowo (2016) expands on this by emphasizing the need to evaluate cognitive, psychomotor, and affective aspects of participants. This comprehensive evaluation approach ensures that Qari/Qariah not only develop technical skills but also a positive mental attitude toward their performance, which is crucial for long-term success.

The research also highlights the central role of LPTQ in enhancing the quality of Qari/Qariah. LPTQ's comprehensive training system that integrates both formal and non-formal education, as explained by Hidayat (2019), reflects the principles of Integrated Learning Systems[14]. These systems combine different learning formats and support structures to maximize the effectiveness of training. The collaboration between LPTQ, the government, and the community is essential to address local needs and create inclusive programs. This multi-stakeholder approach enhances the accessibility and relevance of training programs, which in turn improves the quality of Quranic recitation.

However, the research also identifies significant challenges in enhancing Qari/Qariah training in Jambi Province, including limited resources, inadequate facilities, and the lack of synergy among stakeholders. These challenges are consistent with the Resource-Based View theory[15], which suggests that organizations can only achieve competitive advantages if they effectively utilize available resources. In the case of Qari/Qariah training, limited resources hinder the effectiveness of training programs. As Prasetyo notes, the lack of cooperation between government bodies, LPTQ, and the community exacerbates these challenges. Addressing these gaps requires a strategic approach to resource allocation and fostering collaboration across sectors.

In conclusion, the research contributes to the understanding of Qari/Qariah training by highlighting the importance of practical skill development, continuous feedback, and the role of LPTQ in improving the quality of Quranic recitation. It also underscores the need to address the challenges faced by training programs, particularly in regions like Jambi Province. The findings support various training and development theories, including Behavioral Learning Theory[16], Feedback Intervention Theory[17], and Integrated Learning Systems[18], while also offering practical insights for enhancing the effectiveness of Qari/Qariah training in the future. By focusing on both technical and mental development, LPTQ can play a significant role in preparing Qari/Qariah to become exemplary figures in their communities.

Conclusion

This research highlights the significant role of the Quran Recitation Development Institutions (LPTQ) in enhancing the quality of Qari and Qariah training in Jambi

Province. The findings demonstrate that while LPTQ plays a vital role in improving Quranic recitation by providing structured training, mentoring, and competitions, there are still several challenges affecting its effectiveness. Limited resources, insufficient facilities, and the lack of coordination among stakeholders such as the government, LPTQ, and the community hinder the optimal development of Qari and Qariah. Moreover, the quality of training is influenced by factors such as teacher competence, curriculum design, and the integration of both technical and mental development in the training process. Despite these challenges, the research confirms that the LPTQ's initiatives significantly contribute to enhancing the skills and character of Quranic reciters, preparing them to become role models in society.

Based on the findings, several recommendations can be made to improve the quality of Quranic recitation training in Jambi Province. First, LPTQ should work on improving coordination among various stakeholders, including government agencies, religious institutions, and local communities, to ensure that resources are effectively allocated to support Quranic development programs. Additionally, it is crucial to invest in enhancing training facilities and expanding access to advanced teaching materials and technologies that can support the training process. Training programs should also focus on both the technical aspects of Quranic recitation and the personal development of Qari and Qariah, including confidence-building and mental preparation. Finally, establishing regular evaluations and feedback mechanisms for training programs will help to continuously improve the quality of Quranic recitation and better address the evolving needs of society. By addressing these areas, LPTQ can further contribute to the preservation and enhancement of Quranic recitation traditions in Jambi Province and beyond.

References

[1] Latif, Mohamad Khairul *et al.*, "A Preliminary Study of Basic Vocal Training Methods among Malaysian Young Qari," *J. Acad. Res. Bus. Soc. Sci.*, vol. 11, no. 7, pp. 1228–1238, 2021.

[2] S. F. Baharuddin, "Pendekatan Semantik Dalam Al-Quran (Studi Makna Terhadap Ayat-Ayat Kosmologi)," *Shaut Al-'Arabiyah*, vol. 6, no. 2, p. 179, 2018.

[3] J. E. Dodgson, "About research: Qualitative methodologies," *J. Hum. Lact.*, vol. 33, no. 2, pp. 355–358, 2017.

[4] W. M. Lim, "What is qualitative research? An overview and guidelines," *Australas. Mark. J.*, p. 14413582241264620, 2024.

[5] H. Morgan, "Conducting a qualitative document analysis," *Qual. Rep.*, vol. 27, no. 1, pp. 64–77, 2022.

[6] A. F. Nasution, W. T. Marpaung, U. Hasanah, and S. Maulida, "Implementation of Training Management to Improve the Quality of Education and Learning," *Manajia J. Educ. Manag.*, vol. 2, no. 3, pp. 71–79, 2024.

[7] N. F. Hidayat, "Manajemen Program Tahfidz Qur'an Di Lembaga Pengembangan Tahfidz Qur'an (LPTQ) Matsaratul Huda," Madura, 2023.

[8] R. A. Wibowo, M.-L. Nyan, and N. N. A. Christy, "The challenges for Indonesia to integrate dual vocational education and training system," *J. Tech. Educ. Train.*, vol. 14, no. 2, pp. 79–90, 2022.

[9] T. N. Bauer, B. Erdogan, and S. M. Taylor, "In S. E. Jackson, D. S. Ones,

& S. Dilchert (Eds.)," in *Managing Human Resources for Environmental Sustainability*, New York, AS: Jossey-Bass/Wiley, 2012.

[10] L. Smircich, "Concepts of culture and organizational analysis," *Anthropol. Organ.*, pp. 255–274, 2017.

[11] J. Annett and N. A. Stanton, *Task analysis*. CRC Press, 2000.

[12] K. Murayama, T. Goetz, L.-E. Malmberg, R. Pekrun, A. Tanaka, and A. J. Martin, "Within-person analysis in educational psychology: Importance and illustrations," *Br. J. Educ. Psychol. Monogr.*, 2017.

[13] I. Surdu, H. R. Greve, and G. R. Benito, "Back to basics: Behavioral theory and internationalization," *J. Int. Bus. Stud.*, vol. 52, no. 6, pp. 1047–1068, 2021.

[14] H. M. Truong, "Integrating learning styles and adaptive e-learning system: Current developments, problems and opportunities," *Comput. Human Behav.*, vol. 55, pp. 1185–1193, 2016.

[15] N. C. Ferreira and J. J. Ferreira, "The field of resource-based view research: mapping past, present and future trends," *Manag. Decis.*, 2024.

[16] K. Johnson, "Behavioral education in the 21st century," in *Leadership and Cultural Change*, Routledge, 2018, pp. 197–212.

[17] P. E. King, "When do students benefit from performance feedback? A test of feedback intervention theory in speaking improvement," *Commun. Q.*, vol. 64, no. 1, pp. 1–15, 2016.

[18] D. Wood, J. Underwood, and P. Avis, "Integrated learning systems in the classroom," *Comput. Educ.*, vol. 33, pp. 91–108, 1999.